What's missing from the draft?

Should be shifted or moved around

Are there parts that should be added or deleted? Are these parts that
debate and evidence

Do some parts of the draft need more development, especially with
that change direction midstream?

What paragraphs are short and choppy? Do they have no topic sentences, or
are paragraphs unrelated and contain common problems, include
ideas as she writes?

dear at the end and a sure sign that the writer is changing his or her
If you get temporarily lost, does the overall argument still retention
Can the reader tell the purpose of each paragraph
Could the reader easily outline the draft or write a summary of the
and forecast where the paper is going?
Do the title and introduction orient the reader to the draft's purpose

These

To size up the organization of a student's draft, consider questions like
structure pull also with signaling that structure to readers
structure significantly as we revise. Student writers have even greater
As writers, we all struggle with organization, then rethinking our first-
Is the Draft Effectively Organized?

What's your evidence for this assertion?

You need to anticipate and respond to opposing views here.

You have corrected X well, but haven't addressed Y or Z.

This is too much a synthesis of X, more from summarizing to analyzing.

I don't see how you got from X to Y. Argument is confusing.

When you reword X's point of view here?

Expand and explain: could you show an example?

Good point—one I hadn't thought of in whole this way?

Nice comparison of X to Y here.

Interesting idea!

Concerns:

The following are possible major concerns for addressing these
insufficient is there adequate awareness of and attention to opposing views?
Evidence? Are the ideas developed with sufficient complexity, subject, and

Engaging Ideas

324
Comment on Topic Sentences and Transitions

Paragraphs. Drills can often be improved dramatically if the opening sentence I find that my most frequent comments focus on topic sentences of paragraphs. When I help students rewrite their articles or book chapters for publication, I mention that topic sentences are key ones. If the introduction is strong, and ask the student to revise weak ones. If the introduction

Comment on the Title and Introduction

where are we going?

You're bouncing all over, I need a road map of where we have been and

Your introduction made me think you would do X next, but this is about Y.

into separate paragraphs and develop each

You seem to be making several points here, you will develop them. Break

This paragraph wonders. What's his central idea?

are.

These short, choppy paragraphs make it hard to tell what your main points

Your readers need a transition here.

Can you carry your point in the section that I just mentioned?

How does this point relate to what you said on the previous page?

When you lose me:

Use Marginal Comments to Note Where You Get Lost or Confused

What follows are some communicating strategies that may help writers

improve their structure as they revise.
New Information

Does the Draft Effectively Manage Old and New Information?

A section of a draft in response to teacher commentary promotes feedback. Exhibit 16.1 shows how a student in a first-year seminar revised an original draft. Models of the kinds of paragraphs teachers envision one hopes to see in students' drafts will help students write effective paragraphs with new information. Students can point out paragraphs with logically structured transitions and smooth transitions between paragraphs may need to be added or improved. Either through use of transition words (e.g., therefore, then, next) or the other hand,
and terrorism keep many people from considering the benefits of nuclear power. When I show this example in class, I also show students how the old/new contrast can clarify connections between paragraphs as well as reflect a principle for writing clear, coherent paragraphs in the old/new format.

**Student's Revised Paragraph**

Standing by itself is an excellent bomb material, which is

Kilojoules of Plutonium  

The fact that the bomb dropped on Nagasaki contained six Kilojoules of Plutonium, those words about the

Los Angeles Times, 4/13. This is of great importance considering the

government's missing in Japan and Britain. Nevertheless, the

Los Angeles Times, 4/13. A problem with the reason why 200 Kilojoules and 20 Kilojoules have been

Standing by itself is an excellent bomb material, which is

We can draw out (editorial, Los Angeles Times, 4/13) on the separation of Plutonium from other materials to

This is due to the fact that the process of separating spent fuel

They point out that weapons manufacturers are considering alternative reprocessing techniques, which may be associated with nuclear technology.

While considering external shocks, opponents also want to

A problem is that nuclear power plants aren't safe. The Three

When I give this example in class, I also show students how the old/new contrast can clarify connections between paragraphs as well as reflect a principle for writing clear, coherent paragraphs in the old/new format.
be addressed rather than with the thesis.

of a thesis-oriented essay therefore begins with the question to
books into something the reader is already interested in. The opening parts
bring the thesis; the reader must first understand the question which
The introduction is the thesis. The thesis is the main information presented in the paper
For example, it explains why a thesis statement typically comes at the end
The old/new contact refers to the old/new contact. One should not begin with a

the old/new contact shifts. From the information at old
another phrase "the old/new contact" shifts from the information of old
One principle for writing clear-contact prose is to judge a paragraph's
Otherwise, the opening sentence of the next
another principle can then begin with a breakaway reference. One principle for writing clear-contact prose is to judge a paragraph's

write the first sentence of the paragraph at the beginning of the paragraph. One principle for writing clear-contact prose is to judge a paragraph's
Writing clear-contact prose but something other than the old/new

the dear relationship between one sentence and the next between part and part
between the body of a paragraph and its topic sentence. Between the parts and the whole, coherence refers
seven called coherence, which is closely related to unity. Whereas unity refers to theDear relationship among the various new information that advances the argument, following this principle creates
When to begin sentences with something old—sometimes that this back to what has gone before—

another principle for writing clear-contact prose is the old/new contact. The old/new contact asks

Following the old/new contact? Why?

What follows are two explanations of the old/new contact, taken from Ramage, Bean, and Johnson, 2000.

Thought Exercise on the Old/New Contact

EXHIBIT 16.2
Engaging Ideas
Another argument against nuclear power is that plants are too expensive to build. But this argument is flawed. On March 28, 1979, Three Mile Island Nuclear Station suffered a meltdown. It was the worst accident in the United States. During its commercial nuclear power operation in the United States. During its investigation of TMI the President’s Commission became highly critical of the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) which responded by generating hundreds of new safety regulations. These new safety regulations forced utility companies to modify reactors during construction. Since all the changes had to be made on half-completed plants, the cost of design, time, material, and personnel had to be very large. The standards set by the NRC would not be acceptable to a utility company. All reactors now being built here in the U.S. and overseas, the licensing process can be cut in half without reducing the safety of the plant. A faster approval rate could lower the cost of the construction of a plant because it eliminates all the delays and cost overruns.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>O/N</th>
<th>Confusing string of O/N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>O/N</td>
<td>Confusing string of O/N</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Research has shown that violation of the old/new contract is a frequent cause of confusion in drafts (Collins and Williams, 1985). I find that it takes about fifteen minutes to explain the old/new contract to students and after that I can use this concept to make helpful marginal comments. I refer to Exhibit 16.3 again. This paragraph will fill in some gaps caused by violations of the old/new contract. (For further explanation of the old/new contract, see Ramage, Bean, and Johnson, 2009.)
Your ideas are worth more careful editing. Please find and correct errors.

Sadly, no grade yet because your paper is marked by sentence level errors.
Students often need advice on achieving the right level of grammatical errors.

At the heart of these errors are problems of the passive or style, not accuracy. Incorrect use of the passive voice and syntax rather than right or wrong words, good or bad, sentence structure, spelling, or anything of the sort. The underlying causes, in turn, are the incorrect use of pronouns, subject-verb agreement, and so forth. In other words, pronouns, cases, subject-verb agreement, and the like are not the root causes of grammatical or sentence structure errors in grammar. The problems of the right-based conundrum of grammar, however, seem to concern themselves with sentence structure.

What distinguishes these problems from grammatical errors is that stylistic problems are rhetorical, between-sentence concerns rather than grammatical.

Is the Draft Free of Stylistic Problems?

English class?

rather than possessive

Tips for apostrophe errors—how to use apostrophes with plurals

Sam, you have lots of sentence errors here, but many of them are a real service, here is a typical end-comment:

Here are students recognize a repeated pattern of errors, or if you do not explain the role of pronouns

It is a complex, non-trivial, and difficult system that is more often misunderstood than understood. Teaching a principle is a simple matter (explaining what is meant)

Sometimes, you can explain up many mistakes in one swoop; sometimes, even repeated a dozen times. If you can help a student learn a rule or a character of patterns of errors. Clearly, that may really be one

A final strategy for helping students with sentence errors is to note

"real" vs. "real"

so something out for example, students often do not know if what be careful to distinguish real-based mistakes from stylistic choices. When

Another approach is to be an editor of two paragraphs and then ask

"syntax"

appropriate, I mark it with a comment such as "matched or "lumped"

Whether the error was correct, the sentence is grammatically incorrect

One of the major errors that I need to read any more than to determine

is to read the number of sentence errors. To keep reading of course.

How high I rate the grade depends on how successful the student is.

Writing Comments on Students' Papers 331
I imagined that I had earned the right to play with meaningful games.

and logic, but this was not supported by my parents. Furthermore, a woman

I imagined, to major in mathematics. But this turned out to be even more difficult than

even without a name, reduced confidence, and outright asphyxia. Here is an example:

and logic, but this was not supported by my parents. Furthermore, a woman

I imagined, to major in mathematics. But this turned out to be even more difficult than

I imagined, to major in mathematics. But this turned out to be even more difficult than

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| As a little girl, I liked to play with meaningful games.

**Improved Version:**

As a little girl, I liked to play with meaningful games.

**Revised Version:**

As a little girl, I liked to play with meaningful games.

---

Even though I am not always able to practice what I preach,

---

Understanding when technical language or the passive voice is or is not

---

Appropriate. In addition, every teacher has at least one pet peeve about style, so you

---

Appropriate. In addition, every teacher has at least one pet peeve about style, so you

---

Appropriate. In addition, every teacher has at least one pet peeve about style, so you

---

Appropriate. In addition, every teacher has at least one pet peeve about style, so you

---

Appropriate. In addition, every teacher has at least one pet peeve about style, so you